Cardiovascular risk in women with autoimmune rheumatic diseases

Francesca Romana Spinelli¹, Maria Sole Chimenti², Elisa Gremese³

¹Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties - Rheumatology, Sapienza University of Rome; ²Unit of Rheumatology, Allergology and Clinical Immunology, University of Tor Vergata, Rome; ³Institute of Rheumatology and Postgraduate School of Rheumatology, Catholic University of the Sacred Heart, Rome. *Received 17 February 2019; accepted 12 April 2019*.

Summary. Cardiovascular (CV) disease is the main cause of death in the general population, as well as in patients with rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE). In recent years, many female-specific CV risk factors have been recognized, including pregnancy morbidity and autoimmunity. Different autoantibodies have been associated with CV disease in patients with and without autoimmune disease.

Atherosclerosis and RA share many common pathogenic features, starting from the pre-clinical stage of the diseases: genetic background, environmental factors and post-translational modification of antigens. Although CV morbidity appears to be equally distributed between men and women with RA, some studies suggest a higher risk among female patients with RA. Besides the traditional risk factors, diseasespecific autoantibodies (antibodies to citrullinated and carbamylated proteins) and disease activity contribute to CV morbidity. It is worth noting that female patients have more active disease and show poorer response to treatment.

Amongst SLE patients, younger females are at highest risk of death for CV events. Although survival has improved, long-term mortality is still mainly attributable to CV events. As in RA, SLE patients show higher CV morbidity and mortality that are not fully explained by the excess of traditional CV risk factors. The inflammatory burden and different autoantibodies, in particular the anti-phospholipid antibodies, contribute to the atherosclerotic process. Moreover, disease activity and medications further contribute to CV risk.

Key words. Cardiovascular risk, rheumatoid arthritis, systemic lupus erythematosus.

Il rischio cardiovascolare nelle donne con malattie reumatiche autoimmuni

Riassunto. La malattia cardiovascolare (CV) è la principale causa di morte nella popolazione generale così come nei pazienti affetti da artrite reumatoide (AR) e lupus eritematoso sistemico (LES). Negli ultimi anni sono stati descritti diversi fattori di rischio CV associati al sesso femminile; tra questi rientrano la patologia gravidica e l'autoimmunità. Nei pazienti con e senza malattie autoimmuni diversi autoanticorpi sono stati associati alla malattia CV.

L'aterosclerosi e l'AR condividono diversi aspetti patogenetici, a partire dalle fasi precliniche: substrato genetico, fattori ambientali, modificazioni post-traduzionali degli antigeni. Sebbene la morbilità CV sembri essere egualmente distribuita nei due sessi, esistono alcune prove a supporto di un eccesso del rischio CV nelle donne affette da AR. Accanto all'eccesso di fattori di rischio CV tradizionali, gli autoanticorpi specifici dell'AR (antipeptidi citrullinati e carbamilati) e l'attività di malattia contribuiscono all'eccesso di malattia CV. È importante notare che le donne affette da AR hanno una malattia più attiva ed una prognosi peggiore.

Tra i pazienti affetti da LES, le giovani donne presentano il rischio più elevato di andare incontro ad eventi CV. A fronte di un aumento della sopravvivenza, la mortalità dei pazienti affetti da LES è tuttora causata principalmente da eventi CV. Come nell'AR, nei pazienti con LES l'eccesso di morbilità e mortalità CV non è del tutto spiegabile con il solo eccesso di fattori di rischio CV tradizionali. Il carico infiammatorio e diversi autoanticorpi, in particolare gli anticorpi anti-fosfolipidi, contribuiscono al processo aterosclerotico. Inoltre, l'attività della malattia e la terapia contribuiscono ulteriormente al rischio CV.

Parole chiave. Rischio cardiovascolare, sesso femminile, artrite reumatoide, lupus eritematoso sistemico.

Introduction

Cardiovascular disease (CVD) is the main cause of death in men and women and is one of the major causes of comorbidity and mortality in patients with autoimmune rheumatic diseases; accelerated atherosclerosis accounts for most of the excess cardiovascular (CV) risk¹⁻³.

Traditionally, CVD has been considered a male-specific disease; on the contrary, autoimmune rheumatic diseases mostly affect female subjects. In recent years, awareness of the increased cardiovascular risk among females has grown and more attention has been paid to female-specific CV risk factors. Of these factors, autoimmunity is one of those that has attracted the attention of clinicians and scientists. Most literature data on cardiovascular disease and autoimmune rheumatic diseases concerns rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE). This narrative review will focus on these two diseases and attempts to underline certain aspects that may account for the gender difference in cardiovascular risk in RA and to address the factors responsible for the higher frequency of CV disease in SLE.

Gender-specific differences in cardiovascular risk

For a long time, cardiovascular disease has been considered a male-specific disease; however, whereas men have a significantly higher prevalence of coronary heart disease (CHD) before the age of 50, in women the CV risk starts to increase after the menopause and becomes similar to the CV risk in men in the seventh decade⁴. There is now a growing awareness of the CV risk in females. In addition to the traditional cardiovascular risk factors, female-specific factors contribute to coronary heart disease in women. Firstly, life expectancy is longer in women than in men, and consequently the elderly population - which has the highest risk of CV morbidity and mortality – is mostly feminine¹. Overall, the absolute number of women with CV disease is higher than in men; however, the proportion is unbalanced towards men under the age of 755. Menopause is the best known 'risk factor' accounting for the increase in cardiovascular morbidity following the loss of the cardio-protective effect of estrogens. Animal models and in vitro studies have demonstrated that estrogen receptors (ER) alpha and beta exert many cardio-protective effects. Indeed, estrogens exert their cardio-protective properties by reducing myocardial pro-inflammatory cytokines, inhibiting cardiomyocyte apoptosis, and regulating vascular smooth muscle cells and nitric oxide synthesis in endothelial cells6. Consequently, post-menopausal women have a greater risk of myocardial infarction, which is higher even than in age-matched men⁷⁻⁸.

Besides the 'physiological' increase in CV risk after the menopause, other female-specific conditions, unique to women, contribute to CV risk. Pregnancy complication seems to contribute to the maternal risk of future CVD. Hypertensive disorders during pregnancy - chronic or gestational hypertension and pre-eclampsia - are associated with an increase in traditional CV risk factors later in life. Moreover, pre-eclampsia and eclampsia increase the risk of cardiovascular heart disease, stroke and CV-related mortality9-11. Besides pre-eclampsia, other ischemic placental diseases as well as growth restriction, preterm delivery and recurrent miscarriages seem to influence the mother's cardiovascular history⁶. Whether the pregnancy outcome itself is responsible for the increase in CV risk or pregnancy morbidity shares common mechanisms with atherosclerosis is questionable. For instance, anti-phospholipid antibodies are a well-known risk factor for both obstetric complications (recurrent miscarriage, fetal loss, premature delivery, growth restriction) and accelerated atherosclerosis¹².

Autoimmune diseases are more prevalent among women, with a female to male ratio ranging from 2-3:1 for RA to 9-11:1 for SLE and Sjögren syndrome¹³. Interestingly, the isolated (non-specific) positivity for autoantibodies, in the absence of any systemic autoimmune disease, also seems to increase the risk of atherosclerotic CV events. In 2002, Grainger and Bethell were the first to investigate the presence of ANA amongst patients with coronary atherosclerosis: compared to those without coronary atherosclerosis, patients with stenotic lesions of the three main arteries showed a significantly higher prevalence of ANA (70% vs 15%; p <0.001), without any difference between men and women¹⁴. A few years later, the association between systemic autoimmunity and atherosclerosis was further confirmed¹⁵. In a large population-based study on nearly 15,000 patients screened for anti-nuclear antibodies (ANA), rheumatoid factor (RF) or anti-citrullinated peptide antibodies (ACPA), RF- and ANA-positivity emerged as predictors of CV morbidity - mainly myocardial infarction - and mortality, in those subjects with but also in those without a diagnosis of autoimmune rheumatic disease; more specifically, in women, ANA were associated with death for CV events¹⁵. In a study on 2,278 healthy Finnish subjects aged 24-39, the authors observed that ANA positivity was associated with reduced carotid elasticity in women, even after adjusting for traditional CV risk factors and C-reactive protein (CRP)¹⁶.

More recently, RA-specific antibodies (i.e. ACPA) have been associated with the development of atherosclerotic plaques. In 2013, Cambridge et al. detected a higher prevalence of ACPA at baseline in patients who subsequently developed CHD; even after adjusting for traditional CV risk factors (including cigarette smoking) and CRP, ACPA was confirmed as an independent risk factor for CVD in patients without concomitant RA¹⁷. These findings are not surprising, since citrullinated proteins have been detected in the atherosclerotic plaques of patients not affected by RA¹⁸.

As a matter of fact, on the one hand, atherosclerosis has started to be recognized as an immune-mediated disease sharing common mechanisms with traditional autoimmune diseases such as SLE and RA; on the other, it has been ascertained that autoimmune diseases affect female individuals in up to two third of cases¹³. Therefore, the growing interest concerning CVD in autoimmune disease is not surprising. To date, research has focused primarily on SLE and RA.

Cardiovascular risk in rheumatoid arthritis

The recognition of the excess CV morbidity and mortality amongst patients with RA derives from large population studies and meta-analyses. The risk of myocardial infarction and stroke are increased by 40-70% and death for CV diseases is twice as high in patients with RA than in the general population, and is similar to that observed amongst diabetic patients¹⁹⁻²². Moreover, although CV mortality has significantly improved in recent years, CV disease is still the main cause of premature death in RA patients².

Most observational studies suggest that there is no gender difference in CV morbidity^{20,23}. All the common CV risk factors are more prevalent in RA patients than in the general population, regardless of sex; the only exception is the different distribution of body fat, with female RA patients showing an increase in subcutaneous fat compared to controls matched for body mass index (BMI) and waist circumference²³⁻²⁵. However, some evidence suggests an excess risk in women. Considering carotid intima media thickness (cIMT) as a surrogate marker of subclinical atherosclerosis, Taverner et al. detected a higher cIMT in male patients with RA than in females, yet the linear regression analysis revealed that disease activity was significantly associated with cIMT in women²⁶. Moreover, in a large study on a UK database, the authors confirmed the higher prevalence of traditional CV risk factors in RA patients; interestingly, when gender was added to the traditional risk factors, a significant increase in the incidence of major CV events was detectable only in women²⁷. Indeed, it is not surprising that the O-RISK score 2 adds a multiplication factor of 1.38 for males and of 1.5 for females with RA²⁸.

The excess CV risk in RA can be only partially attributed to the excess of traditional risk factors, and the inflammatory disease itself strongly contributes to the accelerated atherosclerosis (Figure 1). From a pathogenetic standpoint, atherosclerosis and RA are diseases that mirror one another. Starting from the pre-clinical phase, the two diseases share many different aspects: genetic background, environmental factors accounting for posttranslational modifications of proteins, endothelial involvement and inflammatory cell infiltration of the target structures (vessels and joints)^{25,29}.

Besides RF, antibodies recognizing citrullinated peptides are nowadays considered the most specific biomarker of RA. ACPA are involved in the pathogenesis of the disease and are a good prognostic marker as they are associated with a more active and aggressive disease, as well as with a higher mortality rate³⁰. Indeed, both in female and male RA patients, ACPA positivity is associated with subclinical atherosclerosis, CV morbidity and mortality for CV events ³¹⁻³⁶. As regards gender discrepancy and ACPA positivity, in a Dutch population-based study on more than 40,000 individuals with and without RA, van Zanten et al. detected a correlation between female gender and ACPA positivity, regardless of age, smoking habits and female-based variables (parity, menopause, age of menarche and menses regularity)³⁷. Similarly, in subjects at risk of developing RA (seropositive first-degree relatives of RA patients), female gender was significantly associated with ACPA positivity³⁸. The association was stronger in females aged 45-55 and in those who were in the menopause, especially in the early post-menopausal period, soon after the estrogen levels decrease; moreover, after stratification for menopausal status, the effect of age was no longer detectable, suggesting that estrogen levels could have a direct influence on the development of ACPA³⁹.

Citrullination is an enzymatic post-translational modification catalyzed by peptidyl-arginine deiminases⁴⁰. In genetically predisposed individuals carrying the HLADRB1 allele, environmental factors can increase



Figure 1. Traditional and disease-related cardiovascular risk factors contributing to the atherosclerotic process in autoimmune rheumatic diseases.

citrullination; considering the factors responsible for citrullination, atherosclerosis and RA have two common risk factors i.e. cigarette smoking and chronic periodontitis²⁹. It would be superfluous to discuss the role of smoking as a CV risk factor here. Similarly, since the early 1990s, cigarette smoking has been recognized as a risk factor for RA⁴¹. Smoking is more prevalent amongst patients with RA than in the general population and it is associated with RF- and ACPA-positivity²⁵. There is limited literature data on the contribution of cigarette smoking to CV morbidity and mortality in women with RA; however, although smoking is more prevalent amongst male patients, it seems to be associated with an increase in mortality (including CV mortality) amongst females⁴².

In recent years, a new subset of autoantibodies has been described in RA patients: the antibodies directed against carbamylated proteins (anti-CarP). Carbamylation is a mainly non-enzymatic post-translational modification that leads to the generation of homocitrullinated peptides43. Carbamylation involves proteins and lipoproteins both high- and low density by increasing their atherogenicity²⁹. To date, there are no data suggesting gender differences in the prevalence of anti-CarP antibodies. One recent study demonstrated that anti-CarP antibodies, like ACPA, are associated with subclinical atherosclerosis in RA patients without clinical evidence of CV disease, regardless of patient gender³⁶. It remains to be clarified whether antibodies to carbamylated proteins or lipoproteins are also associated with worse CV outcomes in RA patients.

Another aspect to be considered when addressing the topic of CV risk in RA concerns the impact of disease activity on CVD and its relationship with female gender. The modern management of RA aims to achieve disease remission or low disease activity; to quote the title of an editorial published in 2015: "Treat to target in rheumatoid arthritis: good for the joints as well as for the heart?"⁴⁴. Therefore, the strategy, more than the type of treatment, is important for controlling inflammation and disease activity.

Women would seem to have higher disease activity and a lower response rate to the different treatment strategies⁴⁵⁻⁵¹. Data from a large international cohort of more than 6,000 RA patients demonstrated that female patients have higher scores in all the core data set measurements including the activity indices (number of tender and swollen joints, evaluation of pain and global health evaluation, acute phase reactants) and, consequently, a higher composite disease activity score on 28 joints (DAS28); the effect of gender was mild to moderate for all the variables and the swollen joints count was the most similar between men and women⁵². A significantly greater percentage of male patients – almost double – showed disease remission; however, the distribution of therapies for RA was similar in men and women⁵². If the measurements included in the activity indices differ between the genders, they likely account for higher disease activity in females. Besides clinical variables, most of the activity indices include acute phase reactants (i.e. ESR or CPR). One recent paper suggested that the level of highsensitivity CRP before the clinical onset of RA could be a predictive maker of incident RA, as well as a marker of CV death amongst female, but not male, patients⁵³.

As a matter of fact, hormones would seem to affect RA activity: most patients show an improvement of their disease during pregnancy, and estrogen-based therapies (oral contraceptives and hormone replacement therapy) also seem to improve the disease^{54,55}.

Cardiovascular risk in systemic lupus erythematosus

Addressing the topic of gender differences and their effect on CV disease in SLE is more complex. Indeed, of the systemic autoimmune diseases, SLE is one of those with the greatest gender-discrepancy with a female: male ratio of approximately 9:1¹³. Many epidemiological studies as well as translational research have involved only female patients with SLE.

Since the late 1970s, CVD has emerged as the main cause of death in patients with long-standing disease⁵⁶. Patients with SLE have a 2-3-times greater risk of CVD than the general population⁵⁷. Data from large population-based studies support the notion that the survival of SLE patients has dramatically improved in recent decades. As a consequence, in line with better survival there has been an increase in CV morbidity and mortality. In a Swedish study published in 2004, the authors recorded a decline in all-cause mortality over the time, with the only exception of CVD, which remained unchanged and is still the main cause of death in SLE patients – with younger patients showing the most pronounced increase⁵⁸.

Although older patients with long-standing disease are at a higher risk of CVD than the general population, younger patients with lupus have the highest risk57. In 1997, Manzi et al. published a milestone paper comparing the rate of cardiovascular events in 498 women with SLE with age-matched healthy females of the Framingham Offspring Study: women with lupus aged 35-44 were at the highest risk of CHD, showing a 50-fold increase in the relative risk of myocardial infarction⁵⁹. Other studies confirmed the highest risk of myocardial infraction amongst SLE patients in the fourth decade of life⁶⁰⁻⁶¹. Similarly, patients with SLE, especially younger females, are twice as likely to have a cerebrovascular accident than the general population⁵⁷. One very recent paper comparing two inception cohorts of SLE patients followed up between 1975 and 1992 and between 1999 and 2011 showed a significant decrease in the incidence

of atherosclerotic CV events (from 1.8 to 0.44 per 100 patient-years) due to a reduction in the traditional risk factors (hypertension, diabetes and smoking) as well as disease-related disease activity in the second cohort⁶². The results of this study are consistent with the decline in CV events detected in the general population and seem to be partially attributable to a better management of traditional CV risk factors, together with a more widespread use of antimalarials and immunosuppressants⁶². The subclinical features of atherosclerosis can be detected in approximately 30-40% of SLE patients: a metaanalysis published in 2016 showed a higher prevalence of atherosclerotic plaques and increased cIMT amongst SLE patients⁶³. Moreover, most of the studies evaluating flow mediated dilation (FMD), an ultrasonographic measurement of endothelial dysfunction, detected an impairment of brachial artery dilatation in SLE patients⁶⁴.

All the traditional CV risk factors (hypertension, primarily associated with renal involvement as well as with disease activity; diabetes and insulin resistance; metabolic syndrome and cigarette smoking) are more prevalent in SLE patients than in healthy subjects⁶⁵. Moreover, although lupus cohorts are mainly composed of women and the absolute number of women with CV events is higher, male gender seems to account for a nearly 4-fold increase in CV risk⁶⁶⁻⁶⁸. Dyslipidemia deserves separate consideration: indeed, patients with SLE, and to a lesser extent, patients with RA, are characterized by a specific lipid profile with an increase in pro-inflammatory HDL (piHDL)⁶⁹. In 2009, Mc Mahon et al. studied the antioxidant function of HDL in 276 women with SLE and demonstrated that almost half showed a pro-inflammatory and pro-atherogenic HDL-cholesterol profile (i.e. HDL lacking the ability to prevent LDL oxidation); piHDL was detectable in a significantly higher percentage of patients with atherosclerotic plaques or increased cIMT⁷⁰. Besides the increase in piHDL, an increase in oxidized LDL (ox-LDL), correlating with the presence of carotid plaques, has also been described in female patients with SLE⁷¹.

As in RA, also in SLE patients the traditional risk factors alone do not explain the excess CV risk. Many lupus-related factors are involved in endothelial activation and dysfunction, thus contributing to the atherosclerotic process from the earliest stage (Figure 1).

Amongst the many pro-inflammatory cytokines, type I interferon (IFN) is one of the most involved in the pathogenesis of lupus and its pathway has been associated with endothelial repair impairment and subclinical atherosclerosis in patients with SLE. Type I IFN affects the differentiation, survival and function of circulating endothelial progenitor cells (EPCs), the bone-marrow derived precursors of mature endothelial cells involved in endothelium repair. Both ex vivo and in vitro, IFN induces apoptosis of EPCs expressing IFN receptors, thus reducing the number of angiogenic cells and their abil-

ity to form colonies⁷²⁻⁷⁴. In 2012, Somers et al. studied the relationship between the IFN pathway and CV disease in 95 patients (nearly 98% of whom were female) compared to 38 age- and sex-matched healthy individuals without overt CVD: the authors found that a panel of IFN-related genes were independently associated with impaired endothelial function as measured by FMD and anatomic (increased cIMT) vessel changes, thus promoting the accelerated atherosclerosis⁷⁵. The observation that IFN is crucial in the development of atherosclerosis in lupus patients is becoming more important in the light of the potential opportunity to target IFN for the treatment of SLE patients.

B cells play a pivotal role in both SLE and atherosclerosis. Antibodies reacting to many different self-antigens are the hallmark of SLE and, to date, more than 180 autoantibodies have been described in lupus patients⁷⁶.

Given the atherogenic properties of oxLDL, antibodies directed against oxLDL seem to be a good biomarker of atherosclerotic burden and predictors of CVD; however, data on the protective or detrimental role of anti-oxLDL are still controversial77. Oxidized, but not native, LDL may also form stable complexes with $\beta 2$ glycoprotein I (β 2GPI) which acts as an autoantigen; antibodies directed against the oxLDL/ β 2GPI complex have been detected in patients with SLE and/or antiphospholipid syndrome (APS) and have shown a good correlation with atherothrombosis/atherosclerosis78-80. Therefore, IgG anti-oxLDL/β2GPI could be a good marker of atherothrombotic risk. Evidence of the pro-atherogenic property of anti- β 2GPI can be found outside the setting of APS and SLE. Many years ago, Meroni et al. had the opportunity to describe a rare population of 172 young females (<45) who survived myocardial infarction: compared to the age-matched controls, these patients showed a higher prevalence of anti-β2GPI with a significant association between myocardial infarction and IgG/IgM anti- β 2GPI antibodies; the association was further confirmed after adjusting for traditional CV risk factors (i.e. smoking and hypertension, which were associated with myocardial infarction)⁸¹. Besides the B cell response, B2GPI can also induce a T cell response. A specific T cell reactivity to β2GPI was detected in patients with SLE and primary APS (32% and 25%, respectively), correlating with cIMT⁸². In the analysis of two long-term cohort studies, anti-β2GPI emerged as one of the predictive factors associated with CV events; along with cigarette smoking, any aPL positivity, high soluble vascular cell adhesion molecule-1 (sVCAM-1) and high-sensitivity CRP were predictive of CV death in patients with SLE⁸³⁻⁸⁴. The results of these studies corroborate the role of β 2GPI as an antigenic target in atherosclerosis and suggest considering anti-β2GPI antibodies when stratifying SLE and APS patients for CV risk. It is important to remember that the clinical presentations associated with

anti-phospholipid antibodies include obstetric presentations such as recurrent miscarriage, miscarriage, growth restriction and pre-term delivery, which are associated, as stated previously, with poor maternal CV outcomes¹². Interestingly, by analyzing 135 women who tested highly positive for anti- β 2GPI (108 with APS and 27 aPL carriers without any previous clinical events), Chighizola et al. observed that antibodies directed against domain I of β 2GPI, but not against domains IV and V, were good predictors of pregnancy morbidity, particularly late pregnancy morbidity⁸⁵.

Anti-dsDNA antibodies are SLE-specific autoantibodies that may confer a higher risk of CV events⁸⁶. However, not all studies confirm the association between anti-ds-DNA and subclinical atherosclerosis or progression of CVD⁸⁷⁻⁸⁹. An interesting subset of autoantibodies is that recognizing ER, which was described few years ago in female patients with SLE. Colasanti et al. detected the presence of ERa, but not anti-ERb in 45% of 86 SLE patients and none of the 90 healthy controls; anti- ERa was also associated with disease activity⁹⁰. Since both ERaand ERb are somehow involved in the cardio-protective effects attributed to sex hormones, it would be interesting to investigate the possible effect of specific antibodies detected in SLE patients on the atherosclerotic process.

Besides autoantibodies, other SLE-related factors could contribute to the atherosclerotic burden. Both disease activity and chronic damage have been variously associated with CV events, as well as with subclinical atherosclerosis. Moreover, the cumulative dose and current dose of glucocorticoids have also been identified as independent predictors of CV events, increased cIMT and atherosclerotic plaque68. Glucocorticoids could also account for the onset or worsening of traditional risk factors, even after a short disease duration: in an inception cohort of 260 SLE patients enrolled at the time of diagnosis, the authors observed a significant increase in certain CV risk factors (i.e. obesity and dyslipidemia) after 12 months' follow-up, contrasting with the marked improvement of disease activity⁹¹. Disease activity and the current glucocorticoid dose reflect the inflammatory load characterizing SLE, which interplay with traditional CV risk factors and contribute to CVD. On the other hand, disease duration and damage accrual, resulting from chronic exposure to disease activity and drugs, may further contribute to vascular damage.

Conclusions

Atherosclerotic CV disease, once considered a malespecific disease, is the main co-morbidity in patients with autoimmune rheumatic diseases, such as RA and SLE, which mainly affect females. In contrast with the improvement in survival and the better control of disease activity observed over the past two decades, only a slight decrease in CVD mortality has been observed. Awareness regarding the contribution of both traditional cardiovascular and specific disease-related factors is growing and the topic is attracting the attention of a growing number of researchers.

References

- Mosca L, Benjamin EJ, Berra K, Bezanson JL, Dolor RJ, Lloyd-Jones DM, et al. Effectiveness-based guidelines for the prevention of cardiovascular disease in women. 2011 update: A Guideline from the American Heart Association. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2011;57:1404-23.
- Myasoedova E, Gabriel SE, Matteson EL, Davis JM, Therneau TM, Crowson CS, et al. Decreased cardiovascular mortality in patients with incident rheumatoid arthritis (RA) in recent years: dawn of a new era in cardiovascular disease in RA? J Rheumatol. 2017;44:732-9.
- Schoenfeld SR, Kasturi S, Costenbader K. The epidemiology of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease among patients with SLE: a systematic review. Semin Arthritis Rheum. 2013;43:77-95.
- Shaw LJ, Bugiardini R, Merz CN. Women and ischaemic heart disease: evolving knowledge. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2009;54:1561-75.

Key messages

- The awareness of the increased cardiovascular risk among females has drawn attention to female-specific CV risk factors: menopause, pregnancy morbidity and systemic autoimmunity.
- The gender-discrepancy is very evident in systemic autoimmune disease showing a female:male ratio ranging from 2-3:1 for rheumatoid arthritis to 9-11:1 for systemic lupus erythematosus and Sjögren syndrome.
- Rheumatoid arthritis and atherosclerosis share many features; the excess cardiovascular morbidity is related to an excess of traditional cardiovascular risk factors, as well as to disease-related factors including positivity for specific autoantibodies (rheumatoid factor, antibodies against citrullinated proteins and antibodies to carbamylated proteins) and disease activity.
- Cardiovascular disease is the main cause of death in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus, especially in younger females; as in rheumatoid arthritis, traditional and disease-related risk factors (interferonrelated genes and various autoantibodies, amongst others) contribute to the accelerated atherosclerosis that accounts for the excess cardiovascular morbidity and mortality.
- In contrast with the improvement in survival and the better control of rheumatoid arthritis and systemic lupus erythematosus, the mortality for cardiovascular disease has remained unchanged or has only slightly decreased.

- Roger VL, Go AS, Lloyd-Jones DM, Adams RJ, Berry JD, Brown TM, et al. Heart disease and stroke statistics. 2011 update: a report from the American Heart Association. Circulation. 2011;123:e18-e209.
- Chaudhari S, Cushen SC, Osikoia O, Jaini PA, Posey R, Mathis KW, et al. Mechanisms of sex disparities in cardiovascular function and remodeling. Compr Physiol. 2018;9:375-411.
- Gorodeski GI. Impact of the menopause on the epidemiology and risk factors of coronary artery heart disease in women. Exp Gerontol. 1994;29:357-75.
- Dubey RK, Imthurn B, Barton M, Jackson EK. Vascular consequences of menopause and hormone therapy: importance of timing of treatment and type of estrogen. Cardiovasc Res. 2005;66:295-306.
- 9. Bellamy L, Casas JP, Hingorani AD, Williams DJ. Pre-eclampsia and risk of cardiovascular disease and cancer in later life: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ. 2007;335:974.
- Isensee J, Ruiz Noppinger P. Sexually dimorphic gene expression in mammalian somatic tissue. Gend Med. 2007;4 (Suppl B):S75-95.
- Alsnes IV, Janszky I, Forman MR, Vatten LJ, Økland I. A population-based study of associations between preeclampsia and later cardiovascular risk factors. Am J Obstet Gynecol. 2014;211:657.e651-7.
- Miyakis S, Lockshin MD, Atsumi T, Branch DW, Brey RL, Cervera R, et al. International consensus statement on an update of the classification criteria for definite antiphospholipid syndrome (APS). J Thromb Haemost. 2006;4:295-306.
- 13. Whitacre CC. Sex difference in autoimmune disease. Nat Immunol. 2001;2:777-80.
- 14. Grainger DJ, Bethell HW. High titres of serum antinuclear antibodies, mostly directed against nucleolar antigens, are associated with the presence of coronary atherosclerosis. Ann Rheum Dis. 2002;61:110-4.
- Liang KP, Kremers HM, Crowson CS, Snyder MR, Therneau TM, Roger VL, et al. Autoantibodies and the risk of cardiovascular events. J Rheumatol. 2009;36:2462-9.
- 16. Pertovaara M, Kähönen M, Juonala M, Laitinen T, Taittonen L, Lehtimäki T, et al. Autoimmunity and atherosclerosis: the presence of antinuclear antibodies is associated with decreased carotid elasticity in young women. The cardiovascular risk in young finns study. Rheumatology (Oxford). 2009;48:1553-6.
- 17. Cambridge G, Acharya J, Cooper JA, Edwards JC, Humphries SE. Antibodies to citrullinated peptides and risk of coronary heart disease. Atherosclerosis. 2013;228:243-6.
- Sokolove J, Brennan MJ, Sharpe O, Lahey LJ, Kao AH, Krishnan E, et al. Brief report: citrullination within the atherosclerotic plaque: a potential target for the anti-citrullinated protein antibody response in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheum. 2013;65:1719-24.
- 19. Avina-Zubieta JA, Choi HK, Sadatsafavi M, Etminan M, Esdaile JM, Lacaille D. Risk of cardiovascular mortality in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a meta-analysis of observational studies. Arthritis Rheum. 2008;59:1690-7.
- 20. Avina-Zubieta JA, Thomas J, Sadatsafavi M, Lehman AJ, Lacaille D. Risk of incident cardiovascular events in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a meta-analysis of observational studies. Ann Rheum Dis. 2012;71:1524-9.
- 21. Pujades-Rodriguez M, Duyx B, Thomas SL, Stogiannis D, Rahman A, Smeeth L, et al. Rheumatoid arthritis and incidence of twelve initial presentations of cardiovascular dis-

ease: a population record-linkage cohort study in England. PLoS One. 2016;11:e0151245.

- Widdifield J, Paterson JM, Huang A, Bernatsky S. Causes of death in rheumatoid arthritis: how do they compare to the general population? Arthritis Care Res. 2018;70:1748-55.
- Castañeda S, González-Juanatey C, González-Gay MA. Sex and cardiovascular involvement in inflammatory joint diseases. Clin Rev Allergy Immunol. 2017 Aug 29. doi: 10.1007/ s12016-017-8635-2.
- 24. Giles JT, Allison M, Blumenthal RS, Post W, Gelber AC, Petri M, et al. Abdominal adiposity in rheumatoid arthritis: association with cardiometabolic risk factors and disease characteristics. Arthritis Rheum. 2010;62:3173-82.
- 25. Skeoch S, Bruce IN. Atherosclerosis in rheumatoid arthritis: is it all about inflammation? Nat Rev Rheumatol. 2015;11:390-400.
- 26. Taverner D, Vallvé JC, Ferré R, Paredes S, Masana L, Castro A. Variables associated with subclinical atherosclerosis in a cohort of rheumatoid arthritis patients: sex-specific associations and differential effects of disease activity and age. PLoS One. 2018;13:e0193690.
- 27. Cooksey R, Brophy S, Kennedy J, Gutierrez FF, Pickles T, Davies R, et al. Cardiovascular risk factors predicting cardiac events are different in patients with rheumatoid arthritis, psoriatic arthritis, and psoriasis. Semin Arthritis Rheum. 2018;48:367-73.
- Hippisley-Cox J, Coupland C, Vinogradova Y, Robson J, May M, Brindle P. Derivation and validation of QRISK, a new cardiovascular disease risk score for the United Kingdom: prospective open cohort study. BMJ. 2007;335(7611):136.
- 29. Spinelli FR, Pecani A, Conti F, Mancini R, Alessandri C, Valesini G. Post-translational modifications in rheumatoid arthritis and atherosclerosis: focus on citrullination and carbamylation. J Int Med Res. 2016;44(1 suppl):81-4.
- Klareskog L, Catrina AI, Paget S. Rheumatoid arthritis. Lancet. 2009;373:659-72.
- Gerli R, Bartoloni Bocci E, Sherer Y, Vaudo G, Moscatelli S, Shoenfeld Y. Association of anti-cyclic citrullinated peptide antibodies with subclinical atherosclerosis in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. Ann Rheum Dis. 2008;67:724-5.
- 32. Barbarroja N, Pérez-Sanchez C, Ruiz-Limon P, Castro-Villegas C, Aguirre MA, Carretero R, et al. Anticyclic citrullinated protein antibodies are implicated in the development of cardiovascular disease in rheumatoid arthritis. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol. 2014;34:2706-16.
- 33. Mantel Ä, Holmqvist M, Nyberg F, Tornling G, Frisell T, Alfredsson L, et al. Risk factors for the rapid increase in risk of acute coronary events in patients with new-onset rheumatoid arthritis: a nested case-control study. Arthritis Rheumatol. 2015;67:2845-54.
- 34. Ajeganova S, Humphreys JH, Verheul MK, van Steenbergen HW, van Nies JA, Hafström I, et al. Anticitrullinated protein antibodies and rheumatoid factor are associated with increased mortality but with different causes of death in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a longitudinal study in three European cohorts. Ann Rheum Dis. 2016;75:1924-32.
- 35. Aslan AN, Şirin Özcan AN, Erten Ş, Alsancak Y, Durmaz T. Assessment of local carotid stiffness in seronegative and seropositive rheumatoid arthritis. Scand Cardiovasc J. 2017;51:255-60.
- 36. Spinelli FR, Pecani A, Ciciarello F, Colasanti T, Di Franco M, Miranda F, et al. Association between antibodies to car-

bamylated proteins and subclinical atherosclerosis in rheumatoid arthritis patients. BMC Musculoskelet Disord. 2017;18:214.

- 37. van Zanten A, Arends S, Roozendaal C, Limburg PC, Maas F, Trouw LA, et al. Presence of anticitrullinated protein antibodies in a large population-based cohort from the Netherlands. Ann Rheum Dis. 2017;76:1184-90.
- 38. Alpizar-Rodriguez D, Brulhart L, Mueller RB, Möller B, Dudler J, Ciurea A, et al. The prevalence of anticitrullinated protein antibodies increases with age in healthy individuals at risk for rheumatoid arthritis. Clin Rheumatol. 2017;36:677-82.
- 39. Alpizar-Rodriguez D, Mueller RB, Möller B, Dudler J, Ciurea A, Zufferey P, et al. Female hormonal factors and the development of anti-citrullinated protein antibodies in women at risk of rheumatoid arthritis. Rheumatology (Oxford). 2017;56:1579-85.
- 40. van Venrooij WJ, Pruijn GJ. Citrullination: a small change for a protein with great consequences for rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Res. 2000;2:249-51.
- 41. Hazes JM, Dijkmans BA, Vandenbroucke JP, de Vries RR, Cats A. Lifestyle and the risk of rheumatoid arthritis: cigarette smoking and alcohol consumption. Ann Rheum Dis. 1990;49:980-2.
- 42. Sparks JA, Chang SC, Nguyen UDT, Barbhaiya M, Tedeschi SK, Lu B, et al. Smoking behavior changes in the early rheumatoid arthritis period and risk of mortality during thirty-six years of prospective follow-up. Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken). 2018;70:19-29.
- 43. Mastrangelo A, Colasanti T, Barbati C, Pecani A, Sabatinelli D, Pendolino M, et al. The role of posttranslational protein modifications in rheumatological diseases: focus on rheumatoid arthritis. J Immunol Res. 2015;2015:712490.
- 44. Nurmohamed MT. Editorial: treat to target in rheumatoid arthritis: good for the joints as well as the heart? Arthritis Rheumatol. 2015;67:1412-15.
- 45. Hyrich KL, Watson KD, Silman AJ, Symmons DP. Predictors of response to anti-TNF-alpha therapy among patients with rheumatoid arthritis: results from the British Society for Rheumatology. Biologics Register Rheumatology. 2006;45:1558-65.
- 46. Leeb BF, Haindl PM, Maktari A, Nothnagl T, Rintelen B. Disease activity score-28 values differ considerably depending on patient's pain perception and sex. J Rheumatol. 2007;34:2382-7.
- Makinen H, Hannonen P, Sokka T. Sex: a major predictor of remission as measured by 28-joint disease activity score (DAS28) in early rheumatoid arthritis? Ann Rheum Dis. 2008;67:1052-3.
- 48. Ahlmén M, Svensson B, Albertsson K, Forslind K, Hafström I. Influence of gender on assessments of disease activity and function in early rheumatoid arthritis in relation to radiographic joint damage. Ann Rheum Dis. 2010;69:230-3.
- 49. Jawaheer D, Olsen J, Hetland ML. Sex differences in response to anti-tumor necrosis factor therapy in early and established rheumatoid arthritis. Results from the DANBIO registry. J Rheumatol. 2012;39:46-53.
- Couderc M, Gottenberg JE, Mariette X, Pereira B, Bardin T, Cantagrel A, et al. Influence of gender on response to rituximab in patients with rheumatoid arthritis: results from the autoimmunity and rituximab registry. Rheumatology. 2014;53:1788-93.

- Bergstra SA, Allaart CF, Ramiro S, Chopra A, Govind N, Silva C, et al. Sex-associated treatment differences and their outcomes in rheumatoid arthritis: results from the METEOR register. J Rheumatol. 2018;45:1361-6.
- 52. Sokka T, Toloza S, Cutolo M, Kautiainen H, Makinen H, Gogus F, et al. Women, men, and rheumatoid arthritis: analyses of disease activity, disease characteristics, and treatments in the QUEST-RA study. Arthritis Res Ther. 2009;11:R7.
- 53. Masi AT, Rehman AA, Jorgenson LC, Aldag JC. Preclinical biomarker associations with both incident rheumatoid arthritis and its subsequent mortality: sex effects in a 41-year, community-based, case-control cohort study. Clin Exp Rheumatol. 2017;35:966-74.
- 54. Ostensen M, Villiger PM. The remission of rheumatoid arthritis during pregnancy. Semin Immunopathol. 2007;29:185-91.
- 55. Lateef A, Petri M. Hormone replacement and contraceptive therapy in autoimmune diseases. J Autoimmun. 2012; 38:J170-6.
- Urowitz MB, Bookman AA, Koehler BE, Gordon DA, Smythe HA, Ogryzlo MA. The bimodal mortality pattern of systemic lupus erythematosus. Am J Med. 1976;60:221-5.
- 57. Schoenfeld SR, Kasturi S, Costenbader KH. The epidemiology of atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease among patients with SLE: a systematic review. Semin Arthritis Rheum. 2013;43:77-95
- 58. Björnådal L, Yin L, Granath F, Klareskog L, Klareskog L, Ekbom A. Cardiovascular disease a hazard despite improved prognosis in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: results from a Swedish population based study 1964-95. J Rheumatol. 2004;31:713-9.
- 59. Manzi S, Meilahn EN, Rairie JE, Conte CG, Medsger TA Jr, Jansen-McWilliams L, et al. Age-specific incidence rates of myocardial infarction and angina in women with systemic lupus erythematosus: comparison with the Framingham Study. Am J Epidemiol. 1997;145:408-15.
- 60. Ward MM. Premature morbidity from cardiovascular and cerebrovascular diseases in women with systemic lupus erythematosus. Arthritis Rheum. 1999;422:338-46.
- 61. Bengtsson C, Ohman ML, Nived O, Dahlqvist SR. Cardiovascular event in systemic lupus erythematosus in northern Sweden. Incidence and predictors in a 7-year follow up study. Lupus. 2012;21:452-9.
- 62. Urowitz MB, Su J, Gladman DD. Atherosclerotic vascular events in systemic lupus erythematosus. An evolving story. J Rheumatol. 2019: jrheum.180986.
- 63. Wu GC, Liu HR, Leng RX, Li XP, Li XM, Pan HF, et al. Subclinical atherosclerosis in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: a systemic review and meta-analysis. Autoimmun Rev. 2016;15:22-37.
- 64. Mauro D, Nerviani A. Endothelial dysfunction in systemic lupus erythematosus: pathogenesis, assessment and therapeutic opportunities. Rev Recent Clin Trials. 2018;13:192-8.
- 65. Giannelou M, Mavragani CP. Cardiovascular disease in systemic lupus erythematosus: a comprehensive update. J Autoimmun. 2017;82:1-12.
- 66. Pons-Estel GJ, Gonzalez LA, Zhang J, Burgos PI, Reveille JD, Vilá LM, et al. Predictors of cardiovascular damage in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: data from LU-MINA (LXVIII), a multiethnic US cohort. Rheumatology (Oxford). 2009;487:817-22.
- 67. Urowitz MB, Gladman D, Ibanez D, Bae SC, Sanchez-Guerrero J, Gordon C, et al. Atherosclerotic vascular events in a

multinational inception cohort of systemic lupus erythematosus. Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken). 2010;626:881-7.

- 68. Tselios K, Sheane BJ, Gladman DD, Urowitz MB. Optimal monitoring for coronary heart disease risk in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: a systematic review. J Rheumatol. 2016;43:54-65.
- 69. McMahon M, Grossman J, Fitzgerald J, Dahlin-Lee E, Wallace DJ, Thong BY, et al. Proinflammatory high-density lipoprotein as a biomarker for atherosclerosis in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus and rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheum. 2006;54:2541-9.
- 70. McMahon M, Grossman J, Skaggs B, Fitzgerald J, Sahakian L, Ragavendra N, et al. Dysfunctional pro-inflammatory high density lipoproteins confer increased risk for atherosclerosis in women with Systemic Lupus Erythematosus. Arthritis Rheum. 2009;60:2428-37.
- 71. Ahmad HM, Sarhan EM, Komber U. Higher circulating levels of OxLDL % of LDL are associated with subclinical atherosclerosis in female patients with systemic lupus ery-thematosus. Rheumatol Int. 2014;34:617-23.
- 72. Denny MF, Thacker S, Mehta H, Somers EC, Dodick T, Barrat FJ, et. al Interferon-alpha promotes abnormal vasculogenesis in lupus: a potential pathway for premature atherosclerosis. Blood. 2007;110:2907-15.
- 73. Lee PY, Li Y, Richards HB, Chan FS, Chan FS, Zhuang H, Narain S, et al. Type I interferon as a novel risk factor for endothelial progenitor cell depletion and endothelial dysfunction in systemic lupus erythematosus. Arthritis Rheum. 2007;56:3759-69.
- 74. Kahlenberg JM, Thacker SG, Berthier CC, Cohen CD, Kretzler M, Kaplan MJ. Inflammasome activation of IL-18 results in endothelial progenitor cell dysfunction in systemic lupus erythematosus. J Immunol. 2011;187:6143-56.
- 75. Somers EC, Zhao W, Lewis EE, Wang L, Wing JJ, Sundaram B, et al. Type I interferons are associated with subclinical markers of cardiovascular disease in a cohort of systemic lupus erythematosus patients. PLoS One. 2012;7:e37000.
- 76. Yaniv G, Twig G, Shor DB, Furer A, Sherer Y, Mozes O, et al. A volcanic explosion of autoantibodies in systemic lupus erythematosus: a diversity of 180 different antibodies found in SLE patients. Autoimmun Rev. 2015;14:75-9.
- 77. Hartley A, Haskard D, Khamis R. Oxidized LDL and anti-oxidized LDL antibodies in atherosclerosis. Novel insights and future directions in diagnosis and therapy. Trends Cardiovasc Med. 2019;29:22-6.
- 78. Kobayashi K, Kishi M, Atsumi T, Bertolaccini ML, Makino H, Sakairi N, et al. Circulating oxidized LDL forms complexes with beta2-glycoprotein I: implication as an atherogenic autoantigen. J Lipid Res. 2003;44:716-26.
- 79. Lopez D, Garcia-Valladares I, Palafox-Sanchez CA, De La Torre IG, Kobayashi K, Matsuura E, et al. Oxidized low-density lipoprotein/ β 2-glycoprotein I complexes and autoantibodies to oxLig-1/ β 2-glycoprotein I in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus and antiphospholipid syndrome. Am J Clin Pathol. 2004;121:426-36.
- Bassi N, Zampieri S, Ghirardello A, Tonon M, Zen M, Beggio S, et al. oxLDL/beta2GPI complex and anti-oxLDL/ beta2GPI in SLE: prevalence and correlates. Autoimmunity. 2009;42:289-91.
- 81. Meroni P, Peyvandi F, Foco L, Bernardinelli L, Fetiveau R, Mannucci PM, et al. Anti-beta 2 glycoprotein I antibodies and the risk of myocardial infarction in young premenopausal women. J Thromb Haemost. 2007;5:2421-8.

- 82. Conti F, Spinelli FR, Alessandri C, Pacelli M, Ceccarelli F, Marocchi E, et al. Subclinical atherosclerosis in systemic lupus erythematosus and antiphospholipid syndrome: focus on β2GPI-specific T cell response. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol. 2014;34:661-8.
- 83. Gustafsson J, Gunnarsson I, Börjesson O, Pettersson S, Möller S, Fei GZ, et al. Predictors of the first cardiovascular event in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: a prospective cohort study. Arthritis Res Ther. 2009;11:R186.
- 84. Gustafsson JT, Simard JF, Gunnarsson I, Elvin K, Lundberg IE, Hansson LO, et al. Risk factors for cardiovascular mortality in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus, a prospective cohort study. Arthritis Res Ther. 2012;14:R46.
- 85. Chighizola CB, Pregnolato F, Andreoli L, Bodio C, Cesana L, Comerio C, et al. Beyond thrombosis: anti-β2GPI domain 1 antibodies identify late pregnancy morbidity in anti-phospholipid syndrome. J Autoimmun. 2018;90:76-83.
- 86. Magder LS, Petri M. Incidence of and risk factors for adverse cardiovascular events among patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. Am J Epidemiol. 2012;176:708-19.
- 87. Reynolds HR, Buyon J, Kim M, Rivera TL, Izmirly P, Tunick P, et al. Association of plasma soluble E-selectin and adiponectin with carotid plaque in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. Atherosclerosis. 2010;210:569-74.
- Kiani AN, Post WS, Magder LS, Petri M. Predictors of progression in atherosclerosis over 2 years in systemic lupus erythematosus. Rheumatology (Oxford). 2011;50:2071-9.
- 89. Lertratanakul A, Wu P, Dyer AR, Kondos G, Edmundowicz D, Carr J, et al. Risk factors in the progression of subclinical atherosclerosis in women with systemic lupus erythematosus. Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken). 2014;66:1177-85.
- 90. Colasanti T, Maselli A, Conti F, Sanchez M, Alessandri C, Barbati C, et al. Autoantibodies to estrogen receptor α interfere with T lymphocyte homeostasis and are associated with disease activity in systemic lupus erythematosus. Arthritis Rheum. 2012;64:778-87.
- 91. Sebastiani GD, Prevete I, Iuliano AM, Piga M, Iannone F, Coladonato L, et al. Early Lupus Project: one-year follow-up of an Italian cohort of patients with systemic lupus erythematosus of recent onset. Lupus. 2018;27:1479-88.

Acknowledgments

This narrative review was inspired by the meeting of the Associazione Italiana Donne Medico (Italian Women Doctors Association) held in Rome in November 2018, which focused on gender-specific diseases in the basic and clinical sciences. The authors participated in the meeting as part of the association of women rheumatologists and would like to acknowledge the friends and colleagues of the ReDO (REumatologhe DOnne) steering committee: Silvia Bosello (Catholic University of Sacred Heart), Paola Conigliaro (University of Tor Vergata), Cristina lannucelli (Sapienza University of Rome) and Marta Vadacca (Biomedical Campus).

Conflict of interest statement: the Authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Correspondence to:

Francesca Romana Spinelli

Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties Sapienza University of Rome Viale del Policlinico 155 00161 Rome, Italy email francescaromana.spinelli@uniroma1.it